

## NAGALAND INFORMATION COMMISSION NAGALAND COMMISSIONS' COMPLEX BELOW NBCC CONVENTION CENTER POST BOX NO. 148

RIGHT 19 INFORMATION

Nagaland: Kohima - 797004

Email: cic.nagaland@gmail.com | Website: www.nlsic.nagaland.gov.in

No. NIC/APPEAL-6/2025-26 /732

Dated Kohima, the 25th August, 2025

Appellant

Shri. Zhekiho Aye, Khushiabill Village, Dimapur, Nagaland, Mobile No. 8837218852

Respondents

: (i) Shri. Vekhoyi Chakhesang,
Director & FAA,
Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies,
Nagaland, Dimepur.

(ii) Shri. I. Anungba Sanglir,Addl. Director & PIO,Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies,Nagaland, Dimapur.

(iii) Shri. K. Mhonthung,
Deputy Director & APIO,
Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies,
Nagaland, Dimapur.

Public Authority

: Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur.

Date of hearing

: 19.08.2025 at 11:00 AM.

Date of Decision

: 25.08.2025

#### Present:

- 1. Shri. Vekhoyi Chakhesang, Director & FAA Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 8731009972.
- 2. Shri. I. Anungba Sanglir, Additional Director & PIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 9436012807.
- 3. Shri. K. Mhonthung, Deputy Director & APIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 9774023042.
- 4. The applicant (now appellant), Shri. Zhekiho Aye, Khushiabill Village, Dimapur, Nagaland, Mob. No. 8837218852.

### FACT OF THE CASE

An applicant, Shri. Zhekiho Aye had submitted a RTI application dated 29.01.2025 along with the requisite application fee of Rs. 10/- addressed to the PIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, seeking the following information pertaining to Tide Over Rice allocation from April 2021 to March 2024: -

a. Furnish all details with regard to the alloca on of Tide Over Rice from April 2021 to March 2024 and specify the purpose of allocation and or utilization and also furnish utilization certificate if any and furnish reasons if not.

b. Furnish in detail on which festivals, natural, calamities, emergencies etc. for which the Tide Over Rice was allocated from April 2021 to March 2024. Furnish District wise information with regard to the allocations and specify the purpose for such allocations and also furnish allocation order, utilization certificate etc. if any and specify if not.

On receipt of the above RTI application by the Department on the same date vide Receipt No. 936 dated 29.01.2025 as evident on the body of the RTI application, Shri. K. Mhonthung, Deputy Director & APIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur had, vide letter No. DSE/RTI-1/2023-24/930 dated 26.02.2025, informed the applicant that the information sought was ready and to collect the information on payment of Rs. 2/- being the cost of information i.e (one) 1 page in A4 size paper @ Rs. 2/- per page during office hours.

Shri. K. Mhonthung, Deputy Director & APIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur had responded to the above Queries of the RTI application as below: -

Reply to Query a. Details regarding to Tide Over Rice allocation from April 2021 to March 2024 is enclosed as Annexure – 'A' (District wise allocation of tide over category rice from 2021-24).

The purpose of Tide Over Scheme is for non-ration card holders which is

specifically meant for natural calamities, festivals, emergencies etc.

Since the distribution is done by the stockiest and receipt copy being maintained by the stockiest, there is no utilization certificate in the Department.

Reply to Query b. Tide Over Rice issued during festivals, natural calamities, emergencies etc, are being done at Government level. As such, department have no specific record for such allocation.

On receipt of the above reply, the applicant had submitted a First Appeal dated *NIL*, addressed to the FAA, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur stating that the information was <u>insufficient</u> and <u>incomplete</u>, and had, therefore sought additional information as below: -

(i) Specify to who directs the stockiest to distribute the Tide Over Rice to the Beneficiaries.

(ii) Specify to which is the appropriate department or authority at the Government level to issue Tide Over Rice as you have stated that it is issued at Government level.

(iii) Specify to whether the department is responsible to maintain records of the beneficiaries of the Tide Over Rice scheme.

Specify to whether the department or the stockiest is the Authority for granting benefits of the Tide Over Rice to the beneficiaries.

(v) Specify whether the department has complied with the guidelines specified in the food and Security Act.

(vi) Kindly specify in detail the address and contact details of all stockiest in the state.

On receipt of the above First Appeal dated NIL on 24.03.2025 as evident on the body of the first appeal, Shri. *Chubawati Chang*, NCS, Director & FAA, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur had heard the appeal on 07.05.2025 at 02:00 PM along with the concerned parties and passed decision vide letter *No. DSE/RTI-1/2023-24/324* dated *15.05.2025* stating that the information provided by the PIO in response to the RTI application dated 29.01.2025 was correct and that additional queries submitted by the applicant (now appellant) cannot be entertained as per the Act, but advised the applicant (now appellant) to submit fresh RTI application if so desired.

Since the applicant (now appellant) is still not satisfied with the response of the public authority, the Commission has decided to hear the above mentioned appeal by giving opportunity of being heard to all the parties on 19th August (Tuesday) at 11:00 AM in the Hearing Room of Nagaland Information Commission, Nagaland Commissions' Complex, Below NBCC Convention Centre, New Capital Complex, Nagaland, Kohima and had also directed the

following parties to appear before this Commission and to bring the files and relevant documents in question for scrutiny on the above date and time for hearing.

The Director & FAA, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur.
 The concerned PIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur.

3. Shri, K. Mhonthung, Deputy Director & APIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur.

4. The applicant (now appellant), Shri. Zhekiho Aye, Khushiabill Village, Dimapur, Nagaland, Mobile No. 8837218852.

# **OBSERVATIONS AND FINDINGS:**

The Commission observed that the APIO had furnished the reply including the "District-wise allocation of tide over category rice from the year 2021-24" at  $\underline{\text{Annexure}} - \underline{\text{A}}$ , and there was no delay in furnishing the information to the applicant (now appellant). However, the Commission pointed out that the APIO is not authorized to furnish the information and under the RTI Act, the PIO is fully responsible for furnishing the information.

The applicant (now appellant) stated that he was not satisfied with the reply of the APIO and the decision of the FAA that the Tide Over Rice is meant for non-ration card holders which is distributed through the Stockists and no Utilization Certificates (hereafter UC) is maintained and hence no transparency in the allocation of Tide Over Rice. He further claimed that the Department should maintain such UCs which should be duly countersigned by the District Civil Supply Officer and the respective Deputy Commissioners.

Shri. Vekhoyi Chakhesang, Director & FAA, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur informed that he had joined the Directorate a month ago on the retirement of the previous Director. He stated that the Tide Over Rice is for the non-ration card holders which is utilised by the Government as assistance during natural calamities, festivals, emergencies etc. Since the distribution is done by the Stockist, UC is not maintained by the Department, however, Stock Registers are maintained and are being audited by the AG every year. He further informed that the Department has approved a new guidelines and is in the process of implementing the new guidelines. He stated that seventeen (17) new Stockists have been appointed and they are in the process of collecting applications for Ration Cards which will be printed soon. Regarding the furnishing of information to the applicant (now appellant), the FAA reiterated that all information sought had been furnished but supplementary information sought at the time of the first appeal was denied and that the applicant (now appellant) has the liberty to file fresh RTI.

Referring to the information received, the applicant (now appellant) pointed out that when the Department implements the Tide Over Rice and a total of 3,872.72 MTs of rice was allocated to the districts every month between 2021-2024, the Department ought to have the records. He further stated that as per the meeting minutes of DISHA Committee chaired by the then Hon'ble Member of Parliament, Shri. Tokheho Yepthomi, no allocation of tide over rice was received by the districts.

Shri. I. Anungba Sanglir, Additional Director & PIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur submitted that since he was out of station when the RTI application was received, he had entrusted the APIO to furnish to the applicant. He explained that the Stockists deposit money and distributes the stocks and there was no instruction from the government to maintain UC; and the government corresponds to the Stockist directly and not through the Directorate. However, whatever information sought had been furnished and the department cannot give what was not available.

On the above submission of the public authority, the applicant (now appellant) requested that if the public authority can be directed to give in writing that no UC is maintained. However, the FAA replied that the Directorate is under the Government and works on the directions of the Government and hence cannot accept his request.

The Commission agreed with the observations of the FAA that additional or supplementary information cannot be sought at the time of appeals (either first appeal or second appeal), since appeals is/are filed against those queries or information that are not satisfied. The Commission also observed that the public authority do not have the information as UC is not maintained and hence the information cannot be created or manufactured for the applicant. On the request of the applicant (now appellant), the Commission also did not agree with the request of the applicant (now the appellant) to direct the public authority to give in writing.

Since the RTI application was received on 29.01.2025 and sufficient reply was given to the applicant (now the appellant) on 26.02.2025, no delay has been observed in furnishing the information.

### **DECISION**

On the above observations and findings, since sufficient and factual explanation had been given by the public authority, no further action was needed and hence dismissed the appeal.

Decision pronounced in the presence of both the parties on 19.08.2025 at 11:00 AM.

Copies be given to:

- 1. Shri. Vekhoyi Chakhesang, Director & FAA, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 8731009972.
- 2. Shri. I: Anungba Sanglir, Additional Director & PIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 9436012807.
- 3. Shri. K. Mhonthung, Deputy Director & APIO, Directorate of Food & Civil Supplies, Nagaland, Dimapur, Mobile No. 9774023042.
- A. The Computer Programmer, Nagaland Information Commission for uploading on the website.
- 5. The applicant (now appellant), Shri. Zhekiho Aye, Khushiabill Village, Dimapur, Nagaland, Mobile No. 8837218852.
- 6. Office Copy.

Sd/-KEVISA KENSE (IAS Retd.) Chief Information Commissioner

Sd/-

T. KEKONGCHIM YIMKHIUNG

State Information Commissioner

Sd/-

NOSAZOL CHARLES

State Information Commissioner

Authenticated true copy:

(Worhonthung Ezung)
Deputy Secretary